



# General Assembly

Distr.: General  
10 October 2011

Original: English

---

**Human Rights Council**  
Working group on the universal periodic review  
Twelfth session  
Geneva, 3–14 October 2011

## **Draft report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\***

**Ireland**

---

\* The final document will be issued under the symbol A/HRC/19/9. The annex to the present report is circulated as received.

Contents

	<i>Paragraphs</i>	<i>Page</i>
Introduction.....	x-x	x
I Summary of the proceedings of the review process.....	x-x	x
A. Presentation by the State under review.....	x-x	x
B. Interactive dialogue and responses by the State under review.....	x-x	x
II. Conclusions and/or recommendations .....	x-x	x
Annex		
Composition of the delegation .....	x	

## Introduction

1. The Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review (UPR), established in accordance with Human Rights Council resolution 5/1 of 18 June 2007, held its twelfth session from 3 to 14 October 2011. The review of Ireland was held at the 7th meeting on 6 October 2011. The delegation of Ireland was headed by H.E. Mr. Alan Shatter, T.D., Minister for Justice and Equality. At its 11th meeting held on 10 October 2011, the Working Group adopted the report on Ireland.
2. On 20 June 2011, the Human Rights Council selected the following group of rapporteurs (troika) to facilitate the review of Ireland: Bangladesh, Italy and Republic of Moldova.
3. In accordance with paragraph 15 of the annex to resolution 5/1, the following documents were issued for the review of Ireland:
  - (a) A national report submitted/written presentation made in accordance with paragraph 15 (a) (A/HRC/WG.6/12/IRL/1);
  - (b) A compilation prepared by OHCHR in accordance with paragraph 15 (b) (A/HRC/WG.6/12/IRL/2);
  - (c) A summary prepared by OHCHR in accordance with paragraph 15 (c) (A/HRC/WG.6/12/IRL/3).
4. A list of questions prepared in advance by Czech Republic, Denmark, Finland, Netherlands, Norway, Slovenia, Sweden, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland was transmitted to Ireland through the troika. These questions are available on the extranet of the UPR.

## I. Summary of the proceedings of the review process

### A. Presentation by the State under review

5. Ireland indicated its fullest commitment to the UPR process and intention to pay fullest attention to recommendations of the Human Rights Council. The valuable contribution of the Human Rights Commission to the compilation of the stakeholders' submission was recognised, as was the role of consultation with civil society, including our Trade Union movement, in preparation of the National Report.
6. A public Forum for civil society organised by the Department of Foreign Affairs was held in December 2010. The Department of Justice followed up with a series of 7 public meetings throughout Ireland. The Government welcomed the consultations held by various civil society actors and NGOs and the consultations held by the Irish Human Rights Commission. All of these initiatives have led to a very high level of public awareness of the UPR mechanism in Ireland.
7. The State party set out the following commitments as part of UPR process: a Criminal Justice (Withholding Information on Crimes against Children and Vulnerable Adults) Bill and a National Vetting Bureau Bill was presently being prepared and will be presented to Parliament as soon as possible and a revised Children First guidelines will be placed on a statutory basis. Ireland will shortly be in a position to ratify the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography. Mental Capacity legislation for ratification of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities was progressing. Ireland hoped to

sign the Optional Protocol to the International Convention on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights before the end of 2011. Ireland's reservation to Article 19.2 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, concerning the licensing of broadcasting enterprises, will be withdrawn. The Government was committed to developing a system of universal health care. The Government was committed to reducing the time taken to process applications for citizenship to an average of six months. In regard to immigration and asylum matters generally, steps were being taken to reduce unacceptable delays in parts of the system. Legislation was before Parliament which will simplify procedures so that decisions on asylum, protection and immigration can be taken speedily and in a transparent manner.

8. Legislation was being prepared to enable ratification of the Optional Protocol to the Convention on Torture. Legislation was before Parliament to outlaw the practice of Female Genital Mutilation. Ireland was also committed to ratification of the Aarhus Convention. Ireland was committed to reviewing family law and the law on domestic violence.

9. Ireland emphasised that its commitment to human rights was based on the principle that governments must always act with the intention of respecting the rights of the individual and human dignity.

10. It reiterated that it was never acceptable for any government to treat national or religious or ethnic minorities as inferior; or to discriminate against women generally or gay men or gay women; or to discriminate against children and to fail to recognise their vulnerability; or to exclude disabled persons from inclusion; or to repress freedom of expression because it feared or disagreed with the speakers' opinion or where such opinion constitutes incitement to hatred.

11. On the question of human rights, there was no room for moral relativism or selectivity - respect for dignity and human rights that secured that bedrock value was the incontestable baseline of decent politics everywhere. It was also crucial that states which ask human rights questions of others stand on a sound and honest foundation of protecting the human rights of their own citizens. This was crucial to ensure that credibility attaches to questions put to others and so that they are not simply perceived as opportunistic political positioning on the chessboard of international politics.

12. The Government's concern about the welfare of the most vulnerable in society, children, led to a commitment to reorganise the business of Government so as to create a separate Government Department with sole responsibility for children and young people.

13. The national minimum wage which had been reduced has been restored.

14. Ireland's population was growing and becoming more diverse - about 15% of those living in Ireland were non-citizens most of whom had come to Ireland in the last decade. Strategies were in place in health, education and other sectors to promote integration and combat racism.

15. While there was no room for complacency, Ireland had not experienced the anti-immigrant campaigns which had occurred in other countries or the rise in so called hate crime, targeting minorities.

16. The Government was developing proposals for a Constitutional Convention which will review the current Constitution adopted in 1937.

17. The present Constitution contained explicit guarantees in respect of certain fundamental rights and other fundamental rights had been identified by the Courts as being provided for in the Constitution.

18. A referendum dealing with the rights of children will be held early in the New Year.

19. Subsequent to the submission of the National Report, the Government published a Commission of Investigation report into the Catholic Diocese of Cloyne.
20. The Government decided, following consideration of the Commission report, to take the following measures.
21. A Criminal Justice (Withholding Information on Crimes Against Children and Vulnerable Adults) Bill and a National Vetting Bureau Bill, to provide a statutory basis for vetting of applicants for employment and employees working with children were being drafted and will be presented in final form to Parliament as soon as possible.
22. It was intended to place a statutory obligation on every organisation working with children to protect and safeguard those children when in their care - including statutory, private, community and voluntary organisations.
23. Legislation to enable ratification of the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography is at an advanced stage of preparation.
24. A Department of Children and Youth Affairs had been established. Work on creating a stand-alone agency to deal with child protection issues has started.
25. The Minister for Children and Youth Affairs will oversee an implementation framework for each Government Department and sector working with children. The framework will have a strong emphasis on inspection and the need to provide demonstrable evidence that the guidelines are being properly implemented across all sectors.
26. In the case of the Health sector, the remit of the Health Information and Quality Authority was being extended to include oversight of the Health Service Executive's Child Protection Services.
27. Ireland had a dualist system under which international agreements to which Ireland becomes a party do not become a part of domestic law unless so determined by Parliament through legislation.
28. While Treaty Committees have recommended that the Conventions which they variously monitor should be incorporated into domestic Irish law, it was not intended to alter current practice.
29. Work on the preparation of the necessary Mental Capacity Bill to allow ratification of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities was proceeding. A revised strategy for housing for people with disabilities had been launched.
30. The Minister for Disabilities had reviewed arrangements for monitoring implementation of the national disability strategy.
31. The Government attached great importance to having accessible, affordable arrangements in place in order that those whose rights have been infringed can vindicate their rights, especially the most vulnerable in society.
32. Publication of a Legal Services Bill which will provide greater transparency to the calculation of legal costs, provide alternative structures for the delivery of legal services and protect consumer rights had been announced. Enactment of the Bill should effect a reduction in legal costs, of benefit to those most in need of affordable legal services.
33. Rationalisation of the number of state bodies in the area of employment protection will ensure that one agency will deal with all complaints, ensuring that people can access processes to vindicate their rights.
34. The Irish Human Rights Commission and the Equality Authority will be merged to form a new strengthened and enhanced Human Rights and Equality Commission.

35. The new body will fully comply with the Paris Principles and the state party is confident that the International Coordinating Committee will be able to grant 'A' status to this new body.
36. Funding will be provided to enable the new Human Rights and Equality Commission to function effectively and independently in accordance with the Paris Principles.
37. Currently, unemployment stood at a little over 14 per cent. This was a great challenge. The Government had introduced some measures designed to allow people to improve their skills or to find employment and has encouraged unemployed people to return to education.
38. In addition, the State Work Training Agency had been reorganised and refocused to improve and make more relevant the training provided.
39. On matters related to prisons, the Criminal Justice (Community Service) (Amendment) Act 2011, introduced a requirement on judges when considering the imposition of a sentence of twelve months imprisonment or less, to firstly consider the alternative sanction of community service.
40. Particular concern was expressed by the Committee against Torture on a proposed large scale prison building project. The state party appointed an expert group which reported that smaller units of accommodation would be sufficient for needs and would meet the objective of ensuring that the prisoners have hygienic, in-cell sanitation facilities.
41. The Irish Government remains committed to protecting the position of the most vulnerable in society. A core principle of the social protection system is that both nationals and non-nationals can access it equally. The habitual residence condition was however, applied to both Irish and non-Irish applicants.
42. The state party reported that in the last month, some form of supplementary welfare payments were made to 115,000 non Irish nationals. In addition child benefit payments were made to the non-Irish parents of over 215,000 children. About 20% of those aged 18 or under living in Ireland are the children of non-Irish parents.
43. The Government was committed to developing a system of universal health care where treatment will be provided on the basis of assessed medical need rather than ability to pay. This was a radical change and will take time to put in place. The driving force behind these changes was the improvement of services for patients.
44. A study published last year revealed lower life expectancy and other areas of concern, such as a higher suicide rate than in the rest of the population, amongst Travellers.
45. To tackle these concerns national and regional fora had been established, with Traveller participation, to advise on how services can best be delivered and, also, advise on implementation of the national intercultural health strategy, as it affected Travellers.
46. Despite the national constraints, Ireland was determined to maintain efforts to help the poorest people and communities in Africa and elsewhere. This year, Ireland had provided €659 million in aid for programmes in some of the poorest regions in the world.
47. In the aid programme, there was a firm commitment to support state institutions and independent organisations that promoted human rights, governance, and democracy in developing countries.
48. Support was being provided to the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, to a wide range of Non-Governmental Organisations working on human rights issues, and to national human rights institutions in a number of developing countries.

49. Ireland believed that without a strong culture of human rights and good governance, long-term sustainable development is not possible.

50. Ireland was committed to expeditious implementation of the judgment European Court of Human Rights judgment in the A, B and C v Ireland case and an expert group will be appointed in November, drawing on appropriate medical and legal expertise with a view to making recommendations to Government on how this matter should be best addressed.

51. The Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe had noted the action plan submitted by the Government and will discuss the matter in March 2012.

52. On citizenship matters, the Minister of Justice and Equality introduced the new modification in the process to reduce the length of time and the new formal arrangements.

## **B. Interactive dialogue and responses by the State under review**

53. During the interactive dialogue, 49 delegations made statement. Recommendations made during the dialogue are to be found in section II of the present report.

54. Sri Lanka took particular note of the legislative action taken by Ireland to safeguard employment rights, health and safety standards in the work place, and to prohibit discrimination based in gender, race, disability, religious belief. It commended Ireland the provision of free pre-school, primary and post-primary education for the majority of students. It requested to undertake adequate safeguards to ensure that responses to financial and economic crises do not lead to situation giving raise to racism, xenophobia and related intolerance against foreigners, immigrants and persons belonging to minorities. Sri Lanka made recommendations.

55. Cambodia welcomed the step taken by the Government of Ireland to approve the preparation of legislation to ratify OP-CAT and appreciated Ireland's commitment by extending a standing invitation to all UN human rights special procedures. Cambodia was encouraged by Ireland's commitment to implement policies, programs and legislation that aim at promoting and protecting its citizens' rights, including its commitment to review the law on domestic violence. Cambodia made recommendations.

56. Algeria commended Ireland for ratifying most of international human rights instruments and on efforts in combating domestic violence by elaborating a framework to prevent and respond to domestic, sexual and gender-based violence. Algeria expressed concern at the overlapping of several human rights bodies dealing with complaints, monitoring and inspection such as those referred to in Section III (B) of the National report and inquired about the coordination between these various bodies. Algeria made recommendations.

57. France recalled that Ireland had not yet ratified the Convention on the Rights of People with Disabilities and inquired about the obstacles for this ratification. France noted that women continue to be under-represented in public and political life, and inquired about the legislative measures Ireland intended to take in this regard. France also inquired about Ireland's intention to implement the European Court of Human Rights decision A, B and C vs. Ireland relating to abortion. France made recommendations.

57. Canada commended Ireland's focus on implementing the UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children, including through the creation of a National Action Plan. Ireland made progress in protecting the rights of persons with disabilities through, inter alia, passage of the Disability Act 2005, the Education for Persons with Special Needs Act 2004, and the Health Act 2007. Canada made a recommendation.

58. Republic of Moldova commended Ireland for, inter alia, upholding a standing invitation for human rights Special Procedures, establishing mechanisms for the protection of human rights such as the Human Rights Commission which was accredited with "A" status. It welcomed progress in fostering the advancement of women in all areas and acknowledged Ireland's efforts to combat domestic violence against women. Republic of Moldova made recommendations.

59. Greece noted that the new Government intended to convene a Constitutional Convention to consider the need for comprehensive constitutional reform with an emphasis on human rights and asked how the Government envisaged the participation of different stakeholders to this process and whether it would put forward its proposals. Greece inquired about the changes that the constitutional referendum will bring to the rights of the child. Finally it requested further information on the development of human rights after decades of violence and the Good Friday Agreement. Greece made a recommendation.

60. Czech Republic appreciated the draft legislation before the Irish parliament on simplification procedures on asylum and immigration, but remained concerned on Ireland immigration policy. Czech Republic noted that Travellers continue to suffer discrimination. Czech Republic made recommendations.

61. Turkey noted reports that the education system in Ireland is still mainly dominated by the Catholic Church. It referred to reports on the abuse of children while in institutional care included acts that amounted to torture and degrading treatment. Turkey asked for Ireland's evaluation on the situations, and comments on those reports. Turkey made recommendations.

62. Iraq noted that Ireland has extended a standing invitation to Human Rights Council Special Procedures and that was paying particular attention to the rights of elderly people. Iraq made recommendations.

63. Norway commended the Irish Government's work on the report as well as the active involvement of Irish civil society in the UPR process. Norway noted the low living standards in many Irish prisons and inquired on measures taken in this regard. Norway expressed concern at the issue related to employees of an Irish airways company who were prevented from engaging in trade union membership in order to get better working conditions. Norway made recommendations.

64. Ghana noted that Ireland put in place measures to address inequalities, such as gender equality policies to foster the advancement of women in all facets of life. Ghana also noted that the national report refers to Ireland's commitment to eliminate all forms of racial discrimination. Ghana requested further information on the impact of the National Action Plan against Racism for the period 2005-2008 developed by Ireland as a follow-up to the Durban anti-racism conference. Ghana made recommendations.

65. Estonia encouraged Ireland to continue its efforts to launch a national action plan on the implementation of Security Council resolution 1325 as indicated in the national report. Estonia made a recommendation.

66. Egypt noted the efforts exerted to ensure the promotion and protection of human rights, including economic, social and cultural rights. Egypt pointed out that more need to be done in the area of addressing the rights of migrants, combating racial discrimination and racial profiling. Egypt expressed concern about the fact of religious discrimination in access to education. Egypt made recommendations.

67. Australia noted Ireland's announcement to form a new institution, the Human Rights and Equality Commission, by merging the two existing entities. Australia noted that Ireland considered it a priority to hold a referendum on children rights with a view to incorporating those rights in the Constitution. Australia commended the Government's commitment to



promptly ratify the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities.. Australia noted problems in relation to prison accommodation and encouraged Ireland to bring conditions for detainees in line with international standards. Australia made recommendations.

68. Portugal commended Ireland for the broad consultative process in drafting the national report, including the creation of a dedicated user friendly website, and considered that this practice should be followed. Portugal requested further information on the implementation of Article 12 of the CRC. Portugal welcomed Ireland's proposal to increase women's participation in public life and inquired on how Ireland was considering addressing the existing gender pay gap. Portugal made recommendations.

69. Ireland will hold a referendum on the rights of the child in 2012. Preparatory work is already underway. A new Government Department has been established to address issues relating to children. The Government is also preparing legislation to facilitate the establishment of a Child Protection Agency. The delegation noted that independence of the new Human Rights and Equality Commission will be enhanced by the strengthening of arrangements for it to report to the Oireachtas. It will have an important role to play in the advancement of human rights across the island of Ireland, and will continue to work with the Northern Ireland Human Rights Commission in that regard. In relation to the issue of racism, the delegation recalled that Ireland has a strong statutory framework which prohibits discrimination on the grounds of race. The Constitution also contains a provision guaranteeing freedom of religion. Regarding the issue of abortion, the delegation explained that Article 40.3.3 of the Constitution guarantees the right to life of the unborn child with due regard to the equal right to life of the mother. The judgment of the European Court of Human Rights confirmed that Article 40.3.3 of the Constitution is in conformity with the European Convention on Human Rights. The Court accepted that Article 40.3.3 of the Irish Constitution, as interpreted by the Supreme Court in another case, the "X Case", provides that it is lawful to terminate a pregnancy in Ireland if it is established as a matter of probability that there is a real and substantial risk to the life, as distinct from the health, of the mother which can only be avoided by a termination of the pregnancy. This has not been altered by the judgment of the European Court on Human Rights. The delegation noted that the judgment of the European Court on Human Rights highlights the lack of effective and accessible rules in relation to the application of Article 30.3.3. In response to this judgment the Government will establish an expert group with a view to making recommendations to the Government on how this matter should be properly addressed. It is intended that the Expert Group will be established in November 2011. Regarding prisons, the delegation noted that all new prison spaces will have in-cell sanitation. The Government has recently implemented alternatives to custodial measures and further measures are being pursued. The delegation recalled that Legislation prohibits discrimination against Travellers. In relation to recognition of Travellers as an ethnic group, the delegation indicated that serious consideration is being given to the question.

70. The United States of America commended Ireland for establishing a Commission of Investigation to examine the clerical sexual abuse of minors and assigning child protection matters to a standalone government agency. It encouraged Ireland to carry out a transparent and throughout investigation, commended its effort to combat gender inequality in the workplace and welcomed Ireland's committed review of its laws against domestic violence. The United States of America made a recommendation.

71. Slovenia commended Ireland for the all-inclusive process prior to reporting to the UPR WG. Slovenia welcomed the Government's decision to establish an expert group, drawing appropriate medical and legal expertise to address the European Court of Human Rights judgement on the right to a termination of pregnancy in certain cases. Slovenia made recommendations.

72. Timor-Leste welcomed the pledges made by Ireland to improve prisons conditions and looked forward to their realisation. Timor-Leste noted that Ireland, through the enactment of the Criminal Justice Act in 2006, had lowered the age criminal responsibility from 12 to 10 years, for serious crimes, and requested clarifications on the rationale behind these changes. Timor-Leste made recommendations.

73. Uruguay noted the efforts made by Ireland to protect the rights of separated and unaccompanied minor seeking asylum, but deplored the fact that laws do not offer protection following the guidelines developed by UNHCR. Uruguay noted that prohibition of corporal punishment is being reviewed, but is still not punishable by law. Uruguay made recommendations.

74. Chile welcomed the important list of rights recognized in the Constitution as well as the development of institutional framework of protection which includes, inter alia, the Irish Commission of Human Rights, a variety of ombudsmen in the field of children rights, access to information, freedom of the Press, health and financial services. Chile made recommendations.

75. Argentina paid tribute to Ireland for establishing a Ministry for Integration, tasked with the responsibility for shaping public policies in this field. Argentina made recommendations.

76. Switzerland noted that Irish legislation prohibits discrimination against employees, nevertheless certain medical, religious and educational institutions are entitled to turn down application forms from homosexual and unmarried people. Switzerland expressed concern at the situation in Irish prisons, particularly overcrowding and detention conditions. Switzerland pointed out that the mandate of the recently established Prison Inspector is insufficient. Switzerland expressed concerns at the on-going level of violence against women. Switzerland made recommendations.

77. Hungary commended Ireland for its financial contribution to OHCHR. Hungary expressed concerns at prison conditions, including overcrowding, inadequate sanitation and health care. Hungary congratulated Ireland on the unprecedented improvement concerning participation in higher education in the last decades. Hungary made recommendations.

78. The United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland was encouraged by Ireland's commitment to child protection and the steps taken following investigation of the handling of abuse by Church and State authorities, and the assessment of challenges about prison conditions. The United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland made recommendations.

79. Costa Rica welcomed Ireland for the functioning of the national human rights institution in accordance with the Paris Principles and for the progress made in the internal process to achieve accession to OP CAT. Costa Rica commended Ireland for extending a standing invitation to the UN human rights Special Procedures and for efforts made to address domestic violence and trafficking in persons. Costa Rica made recommendations.

80. Latvia noted the efforts made so far by the Government with regard to combating trafficking in human beings, but expressed concern about reports of sham marriages and requested to know when Ireland will pass legislation to address this issue. Latvia made recommendations.

81. Austria commended Ireland for its efforts in combating domestic, sexual and gender-based violence, including the adoption of a National Women's Strategy and inquired whether Ireland is considering an independent assessment of the Strategy as recommended by CEDAW. Austria requested an update on the work of the expert group established to examine the possibility of constructing a new prison. Austria commended Ireland for its commitment to ratify the Convention on the Rights of Persons with

Disabilities and requested further information on Ireland's intention to ratify the Optional Protocol to this convention. Austria made recommendations.

82. Denmark was encouraged by the Government of Ireland commitment to improve prison conditions in the country, including new and re-commissioned prison cell accommodation with in-cell sanitation. It welcomed Ireland's intention to convene a constitutional convention to consider the need for comprehensive constitutional reform, including consideration of the need for strengthening children and women's rights. Denmark asked what the Government will do to ensure that the merge of the Human Rights Commission and the Equality Authority enhance and strengthen Ireland's human rights and equality structures. Denmark made recommendations.

83. Sweden welcomed the recent establishment of a separate government ministry specifically dedicated to children and youth affairs and hoped that this will expedite the closure of reported gaps in the protection and promotion of children's rights. Sweden made recommendations.

84. Ireland explained that the work of the Constitutional convention is expected to include a review of the provisions in relation to the role of women and the family. New legislation enacted in 2011 contains further protections for women who experience domestic violence. The Government intends to introduce a consolidated Domestic Violence Bill in 2012. In relation to comments about inter-prisoner violence the delegation rejected the assertion that the issue was particularly bad in Irish prisons. The delegation noted that Ireland has a comprehensive social protection infrastructure. The National Action Plan for Social Inclusion 2007-2016 demonstrates the Government's commitment to combating poverty and building an inclusive society. The Government is aware of the difficulties which have arisen with regards to what have been termed "sham marriages". An Garda Síochána is liaising with the law enforcement authorities in other jurisdictions, within and outside the EU, for the purpose of combating criminality associated with marriages of convenience. The provisions of the Immigration and Residence Protection Bill are being actively examined to identify any further amendments which can be made to tackle the problems associated with such marriages. The Delegation stated that a co-ordinated approach by EU Member States is required in order to deal with the issue.

85. Spain recognized the full respect for human rights in Ireland, as reflected in the country's accession to most international human rights conventions; the open and standing invitation extended to the UN special procedures, as well as the existence of the Irish National Human Commission that has an "A" status, the protection of minors and human rights training of armed forces. Spain noted, however, that there were still areas that needed improvement. Spain made recommendations.

86. Peru congratulated Ireland for the broad consultations in the drafting of its national report, specially the initiative to create an internet portal where inputs can be submitted. Peru recognised significant progress made by Ireland through the establishment of national bodies, inter alia, the Irish Human Rights Commission, the National Authority for Disabilities. Peru also commended Ireland for its attempts to promote human rights training at various levels in the nation. Peru made recommendations.

87. Mexico acknowledged the significant action carried out by Ireland in the field of promotion and protection of human rights like the ratification of most of international human rights treaties. Mexico expressed hope that the provisions contained in the instruments to which Ireland is party in be fully implemented and that CPRD be ratified as soon as possible. Mexico made recommendations.

88. Islamic Republic of Iran expressed concern over a number of human rights issues raised in relevant United Nations reports and inquired about the measures taken on the following issues: racism, xenophobia, discrimination against Muslims and persons

belonging to minorities, high rates of domestic violence against women, unsatisfactory prison conditions, lengthy detention periods for asylum seekers, inaccessibility of Irish healthcare system to migrants, refugees and asylum seekers. Iran made recommendations.

89. Romania appreciated the fact that the national report identified the challenges in the human rights system and took note on Government's action to ensure proper exercise of the rights for its citizens. Romania hoped that Ireland will present a mid-term report on the implementation of the recommendations accepted in this UPR session. Romania encouraged the ratification of CED and CRPD. Romania made a recommendation.

90. Uzbekistan recalled CERD concerns regarding increased discrimination, particularly vis-à-vis persons of African origin and the lack of legislation preventing racial profiling by the police and other law enforcement bodies. Uzbekistan further noted that the persistence of unsatisfying conditions in Irish prisons was of great concern, specially overcrowding, problematic sanitary conditions and violence amongst inmates. Uzbekistan made recommendations.

91. Netherlands acknowledged that the Government of Ireland had given consideration to the position of disadvantaged groups when taking austerity measures. Netherlands also noted that the Government undertook to establish an expert group by November 2011 to make recommendations on how to implement the 1992 Supreme Court judgement in the X case and later judgements of the European Court regarding abortion in limited circumstances. Netherlands made recommendations.

92. Slovakia commended Ireland for its open and constructive participation to the UPR and noted the broad consultation process for the preparation of the national report. Special credit should be accorded to Ireland's recent efforts in advancing children's rights such as the establishment of the Department for Children and Youth Affairs. Slovakia made recommendations.

93. Ecuador acknowledged the high level of enforcement and protection of human rights in Ireland. Ecuador also recalled that in the context of economic crisis, budgetary cuts should not hinder Ireland's obligations for social protection. Ecuador made recommendations.

94. Brazil noted the availability of publicly-funded hospital services and commended Ireland for the adoption of the National Women's Strategy 2007-2016. Brazil expressed concern at racial profiling by law enforcement officials and detention periods for asylum-seekers under the Immigration Act, and at the fact that persons detained for immigration-related reasons are jailed in ordinary facilities. Brazil also expressed concern at the accessibility of migrants, refugees and asylum-seeker to healthcare system. Brazil made recommendations.

95. Indonesia noted the positive efforts of the Government of Ireland to provide a framework and safeguards for the protection of civil, political economic and cultural rights for all people in Ireland. In particular, Indonesia commended the guarantee of the right to assembly and the standard of working conditions, as well as the allocations in the State budget for health care and education. Indonesia made recommendations.

96. Pakistan noted the resolve of the Government of Ireland to provide better education and health services to the Travellers Community. Pakistan mentioned that in 2011 CERD noted with regret that the economic recession is likely to threaten the on-going efforts of the government to combat racial discrimination due to disproportionate budget cuts to those mechanisms dealing with anti-racism agenda. Pakistan made recommendations.

97. Malaysia noted with concern the increase in complaints of discrimination against minority groups including Muslims. Instances of racial profiling of non-Irish persons by police and other law enforcement personnel have also reportedly increased. Malaysia asked

the delegation of Ireland to elaborate on the measures taken by the Government to promote diversity and tolerance of other faiths and beliefs. Malaysia made recommendations.

98. Azerbaijan noted that CERD reiterated that responses to financial and economic crises should not lead to a situation which would potentially give rise to racism, racial discrimination and xenophobia, and related intolerance against foreigners and persons belonging to minorities. CERD also expressed concern at the lack of legislation proscribing racial profiling by the Garda Síochána (Police) and other law enforcement personnel. Azerbaijan made recommendations.

99. Honduras acknowledged that Ireland ratified most of main international instruments and that has extended a standing invitation to the Human Rights Council Special Procedures. While noting Ireland's efforts to eliminate racial discrimination, Honduras expressed concern at reports of racial profiling by police. Honduras inquired about Ireland's intentions to a National Action Plan and to ratify OP-CAT. Honduras made a recommendation.

100. Mentioning Ireland's last report to CERD in which Ireland stated that whether or not Travellers are considered as a distinct ethnic group is of no domestic legal significance, Afghanistan inquired about Ireland's reluctance to recognize Travellers ethnicity. Afghanistan also asked Ireland to expand on steps it intended to take in order to tackle Travellers health issues.

101. Ukraine encouraged Ireland to undertake further measures aimed at increasing the participation of women in the labour market and their role in public life. Ukraine pointed out that while accommodation and full board are provided for asylum-seekers in the "Direct Provision" system, there are variations in standards among privately operated centres.

102. Germany noted that Ireland has signed in 2007 the Convention on the Rights of People with Disabilities and inquired about the status of the ratification of that Convention. Germany also noted that Ireland has achieved considerable progress in the area of gender equality in recent year but pointed out that stereotypical gender roles subsist and women still face inequality. Germany welcomed the establishment of a Constitutional Convention which will tackle this issue. Germany inquired whether and when Ireland intended to abolish the Offence against Persons Act and adopt legislation that provide for effective procedures determining the legality of abortions.

103. Thailand welcomed the comprehensive legislation regarding refugees and asylum seekers. It mentioned the prison conditions and Ireland's efforts to redress this situation. Thailand encouraged the Irish Government to ensure protection of the rights of all vulnerable groups, particularly women and children, and commended the establishment of an independent commission to investigate allegations of violence against women and children. Thailand made recommendations.

104. With regard to racial profiling, the delegation of Ireland reiterated that An Garda Síochána does not engage in, or carry out, this practice. The delegation noted that the Government maintains an ongoing dialogue and engagement with all faith and non-faith groups. Discrimination on religious grounds is prohibited. Freedom of assembly and freedom of expression are guaranteed by the Constitution and fully respected by the Government. These freedoms include the right to partake in demonstrations and to participate in the political process. The delegation recalled that Ireland's legislation provides strong protection against religious discrimination and incitement to hatred, including Islamophobia. "Hate speech" can be criminally prosecuted through the Irish Courts. The delegation of Ireland thanked all delegations for their contributions to the interactive dialogue, and welcomed the constructive spirit in which recommendations were given.

## II. Conclusions and/or recommendations

105. The recommendations formulated during the interactive dialogue and listed below have been examined and enjoy the support of Ireland:

105.1. Complete the ratification process (Indonesia), consider the ratification (Chile, Ecuador) or the possibility of ratification (Argentina, Peru), ratify the Convention on the Rights of People with Disabilities (Austria, Canada, Greece, Iran, Iraq, Spain) already signed in 2007 (Algeria), at the earliest possible time/as soon as possible (France, Hungary);

105.2. Become a party (Estonia), consider accession (Brazil), ratification (Chile), ratify the Optional Protocol to the Convention Against Torture (OP-CAT) (France, Greece, Slovenia, United Kingdom) and set up a national prevention mechanism that meets the criteria and guarantees under this instrument (Switzerland);

105.3. Continue the efforts for a speedy ratification of the Optional Protocol of the Convention against torture (Peru);

105.4. Pursue efforts to ratify (Iraq), complete the ratification process (Indonesia), consider the possibility of ratifying (Argentina, Ecuador), ratify the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance (CED) (Spain) as soon as possible (France);

105.5. Continue the process of accession to or ratification of the pending main international human rights instruments, in particular CED and CRPD (Costa Rica);

105.6. Consider the ratification (Chile, Ecuador), ratify the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of Child the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography (OP-SCR) (Portugal, Slovenia), as soon as possible (France);

105.7. Reinforce the independence and the capacity of the Irish Human Commission to fulfil its mandate effectively in accordance with the Paris Principles (Moldova), by endowing it with adequate and sufficient resources (Ghana);

105.8. Ensure and strengthen the independence of its national human rights infrastructure (Egypt);

105.9. Implement its commitment to holding a constitutional referendum on children's rights with a view to incorporating those rights in the Irish constitution (Australia);

105.10. Ensure a comprehensive and effective incorporation of children's rights in its legal framework in line with the CRC, by incorporating children's rights in the Constitution (Portugal);

105.11. Give further effect to international human rights instruments in the domestic legislation, including from the provisions contained in the CRC (Indonesia);

105.12. Ensure that the current budget cuts do not result in stifling the activities of human rights bodies (Turkey);

105.13. Work with all sectors to ensure the Human Rights and Equality Commission is an effective agent for enhancing the country's commitment to human rights (Australia);

105.14. Continue to provide support for human rights education and training domestically in order to enhance awareness and respect for human rights (Moldova);

105.15. Take measures to make available to people with disabilities access, on equal footing, to education, employment, housing, transport, cultural life and facilitate their access to public places and services (Costa Rica);

105.16. Continue with the efforts related to the protection of the rights of people with disabilities (Ecuador);

105.17. Enact laws that protect adequately the rights and the well-being of separated and unaccompanied minors seeking asylum in conformity with standards established under international laws (Uruguay);

105.18. Take the measures required to respect economic, social and cultural rights (Iraq);

105.19. Continue the efforts to ensure the exercise of human rights by the sections of society needing a special attention from the authorities (Romania);

105.20. Continue action including legislation to remove gender-based inequalities in the work place, including wage disparities between men and women (Sri Lanka);

105.21. Take additional measures to eliminate inequalities between women and men (Moldova);

105.22. Continue its efforts to ensure that migrants and women belonging to minorities continue to be the focus of governmental programs specifically geared towards the protection of their rights (Argentina);

105.23. Take measures to tackle racial discrimination and to combat more resolutely all forms of racism, xenophobia and religious intolerance against foreigners and religious minorities, including Muslims (Iran);

105.24. Fight Islamophobia and support its Muslim citizens, by enabling them to practice their religion (Iran);

105.25. Ensure that any person involved in xenophobic and Islamophobic acts is investigated and prosecuted (Iran);

105.26. Take more effective measures to combat racial discrimination and intolerance, including by promptly investigating and taking stern action against perpetrators of racism, xenophobic and discriminatory acts and by promoting intercultural understanding and tolerance between the different ethnic and faith groups in the country (Malaysia);

105.27. Strengthen its efforts to protect the human rights of all Ireland's citizens, including those from sub-Saharan Africa (Indonesia);

105.28. Ensure that any persons involved in racial discrimination acts are investigated and prosecuted, and if found guilty on such incidents, punished with appropriate penalties (Azerbaijan);

105.29. Maintain the strategies of holistic health and provisions of health care, with special emphasis on vulnerable groups, despite the budget cuts due to economic crisis (Chile);

105.30. Strengthen the measures to improve the representation, education and protection of the Travellers (Chile);

105.31. Continue its work for the full realization of human rights of the Traveller community in the country (Sweden);

105.32. Continue pursuing appropriate policies designed to provide for equal opportunities to members of the Traveller community, with special focus on access

to health care, education and housing, including ensuring Travellers participation in public life related decision making process. (Slovakia);

105.33. Improve social and economic conditions of the members of the Traveller community (Pakistan);

105.34. Continue action to protect the conditions of migrant workers by improving existing legislation (Sri Lanka);

105.35. Ensure specifically that economic measures do not disproportionately impact upon the elderly (Netherlands);

105.36. Take effective measures to improve prison's conditions (Algeria);

105.37. Give priority to bringing conditions and treatment of detainees in Irish prisons into line with International human rights standards, including through implementing outstanding recommendations from international human rights bodies (Norway);

105.38. Improve conditions for detainees in Irish prisons to bring them in line with international standards (Australia);

105.39. Continue its efforts to incorporate in-cell sanitation in all prison facilities (USA);

105.40. Further improve the conditions of the detainees in the line with international human rights standards (Hungary);

105.41. Take as soon as possible effective measures in order to avoid overcrowding in prisons and other detention facilities, in line with the Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners (Austria);

105.42. Give due attention to the results of the expert group examining the possibility of the construction of a new prison (Austria);

105.43. Increase the use and promotion of alternative, non-custodial measures (Austria);

105.44. Continue its effort to secure satisfactory sanitary facilities in Irish prisons, including in cell sanitation, and to mitigate over-crowding (Denmark);

105.45. Urgently and comprehensively bring conditions for the prison population into line with international human rights standards (Sweden);

105.46. Carry out all the effort to reduce overcrowding in prisons and to ensure that imprisonment is a measure of last resort (Spain);

105.47. Continue with the implementation of measures to improve adverse conditions in prisons, in particular the renovations required to improve the health situation in the prisons and effective programmes for education and rehabilitation of the prison inmates (Peru);

105.48. Complete the review of prison conditions in order to increase the quality of the prison management system (Indonesia);

105.49. Continue to strengthen its policies and laws against domestic violence (Algeria);

105.50. Strengthen its policies and laws against domestic violence towards women (Moldova);

105.51. Continue efforts with the aim of establishing protection campaigns and programs for women against domestic violence (Argentina);



105.52. Submit rapidly its national report to the CEDAW committee that was due in 2007 and include a section on violence against women as requested by the committee (Switzerland);

105.53. Fully implement the relevant laws, policies and programmes aimed at combating domestic violence in the country (Malaysia);

105.54. Pass legislation to combat trafficking in human beings in the form of sham marriages (Latvia);

105.55. Support its Muslim citizens in enabling them to practice their religion (Turkey);

105.56. Make available, adequate budgetary allocations, despite financial constraints, for the continued provision and improvement of education and health services which are essential to protect the rights of the poorest and the most vulnerable members of the society (Sri Lanka);

105.57. Ensure the principle of equality and non-discrimination while guaranteeing the enjoyment of the right to health (Brazil);

105.58. Ensure the national availability and accessibility to contraceptive services and methods, including through the dissemination of information and education to boys, girls and adolescents taking into account prevention of discrimination based on of geographic, status, disability or migrant status (Mexico);

105.59. Further measures to eliminate the under-representation of women in decision-making roles, particularly in the political arena and as members of corporate boards (Ghana);

105.60. Establish a consolidated framework relating to immigration and asylum issues, including an independent Appeals body (United Kingdom);

105.61. Ensure that all asylum seekers in Ireland can effectively accede to the process of determination of their refugee condition and that the decisions on the necessity for international protection can be reviewed and be subject to independent judicial supervision (Mexico);

105.62. Continue to allocate financial assistance for developing countries in the framework of ODA (Official Development Assistance) and meet the commitment made in this regard at the international level (Algeria);

106. The following recommendations will be examined by Ireland which will provide responses in due time, but no later than the 19<sup>th</sup> session of the Human Rights Council in March 2012:

106.1. Sign and ratify the Optional Protocol to the CRPD (Austria, Spain);

106.2. Continue the process of accession to or ratification of the pending main international human rights instruments in particular OP CRPD (Costa Rica);

106.3. Withdraw its reservations to the ICCPR (Brazil);

106.4. Consider incorporating the right to health and the right to housing (Portugal) and sign and ratify the Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (OP-ICESCR) (Ecuador);

106.5. Withdraw its reservations to ICERD, ICESCR and ICCPR (Iran);

106.6. Ratify the UNESCO Convention against discrimination in education (Hungary) and incorporate into law (Iran);

- 106.7. Adopt practical and legal measures to curb racial discrimination and discrimination against migrants and to look at the appeal by UNESCO (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization) to ratify the 1960 Convention to counter discrimination in the area of education (Uzbekistan);
- 106.8. Continue the implementation of the recommendations made by CERD (Iraq);
- 106.9. Ensure the comprehensive and effective incorporation of children's rights in Ireland's legal framework in line with the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child by incorporating children's rights into the Constitution (Cambodia);
- 106.10. Urgently take measures necessary to ensure that the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child is fully implemented and incorporated into the legal and administrative system of Ireland (Sweden 1);
- 106.11. Consider alternative (legislative) measures that will enhance the position of children in the short term (i.e. extending the remit of the Ombudsman to children in prisons and asylum seeking children) (Netherlands);
- 106.12. Strengthen the legal framework for the protection of the rights of children and the rights of other vulnerable groups such as women, the elderly, people with disabilities and the community of Travellers (Peru);
- 106.13. Enhance legal action against all forms of discrimination on the basis of race, ethnic, language, religion or national origin, in particular comprehensive respect of human rights of foreigners regardless of their migratory status (Ecuador);
- 106.14. Develop and adopt a gender parity law (France);
- 106.15. Pursue efforts aimed at strengthening the protection the protection of all people from racial discrimination and by improving the existing draft pieces of legislation and passing them into law (Ghana);
- 106.16. Adopt laws to deal with the situation of persons suffering from the highest level of physical and mental health with regards to the 2001 Act on Mental Health and bring its provisions in line with the CRPD (Spain);
- 106.17. Withdraw the provisions entered into force on 1 January 2010 making blasphemy punishable as they may constitute an excessive limitation to the freedom of expression (France);
- 106.18. Take steps to ensure that the current economic crisis does not erode human rights, in particular by developing a National Action Plan on Human Rights as well as by providing the continued support and shared experience on human rights worldwide (Cambodia);
- 106.19. Develop provisions of a training programme to raise the awareness of the judiciary to the racial dimension of crime and to ensure that judges take into account racist motivation as an aggravating circumstance when they sentence in criminal cases (Uruguay);
- 106.20. Adopt immediate measures to assign an ad litem tutor or adviser to unaccompanied minor independently whether an application for protection has been submitted (Uruguay);
- 106.21. Enact laws setting principles on law, rights and obligations that govern family reunification (Uruguay);
- 106.22. Draw up an integrated and comprehensive human rights plan of action (Indonesia);

- 106.23. Ensure the full implementation and undertake an independent assessment of the National Women Strategy (Austria);
- 106.24. In line with the recommendations made by CERD, adopt and implement immediately legislation prohibiting any form of racial discrimination and ensure humanitarian treatment to migrants and persons of non-Irish origin, including through adequate training for the judicial and police personnel (Mexico);
- 106.25. Consider strengthening its National Action Plan against Racism (Brazil);
- 106.26. Fully explore the possibility of putting in place a new National Plan of Action against Racism (Malaysia);
- 106.27. Accelerate efforts in establishing national network of schools that guarantee equality of access to children irrespective of their religious, cultural or social background (Malaysia);
- 106.28. Strengthen the protection of all people from racial discrimination by improving the existing draft pieces of legislation and passing them into law (Pakistan);
- 106.29. Establish appropriate mechanisms to encourage the reporting of racist incidents and crimes (Azerbaijan);
- 106.30. Investigate the reports of “knife stabbings” against people mainly from Sub-Saharan Africa and ensure that the perpetrators are prosecuted and when convicted, punished with appropriate penalties (Azerbaijan);
- 106.31. Introduce a complete integration policy to for this specific group (referring to Travellers who continue to suffer from discrimination) (Czech Republic);
- 106.32. Introduce measures to improve the conditions of Travellers in the society and introduce a comprehensive system for the monitoring of racist incidents (Turkey);
- 106.33. Recognize the Travellers as an official minority (Slovakia);
- 106.34. Activate efforts to improve the living conditions of detainees pre-trial and after conviction and also to implement all the requirements of minimum standards of treatment of inmates (Uzbekistan);
- 106.35. Take the necessary measures to avoid detention of asylum seekers and to avoid situations which may equate the condition of immigrants to that of felons (Brazil);
- 106.36. Enhance its efforts at the local level to better carry out the campaign against domestic violence (Switzerland);
- 106.37. Sign the Council of Europe Convention on Violence against Women and Domestic Violence (Austria);
- 106.38. Strengthen its policies and laws against domestic violence and prepare adequate statistics, including sex, age and family relationship of victims and perpetrators (Pakistan);
- 106.39. Implement the UN rules for the Treatment of Women Prisoners and Non-Custodial Measures for Women Offenders, otherwise known as the “Bangkok Rules” as the Bangkok Rules (Thailand);
- 106.40. Institute a comprehensive statutory inquiry and compensation scheme in order to guarantee accountability and assist the (women and children) victims (of violence) (Thailand);

- 106.41. Explicitly prohibit any form of corporal punishment in the family and continue developing awareness raising campaign and education for parents and for the public in general (Uruguay);
- 106.42. Promote forms of discrimination and non-violent discipline as an alternative to corporal punishment taking into consideration General Comment No. 8 of the Committee on the Right of the Child on the protection of children from corporal punishment and other cruel or degrading forms of punishment (Uruguay);
- 106.43. Amend the Civil Registration Act empowering the registers and the Garda (police) to intervene against sham marriages and to amend Criminal law to criminalize the organizers and facilitators of sham marriages (Latvia);
- 106.44. Deepen the Reform the law on same sex marriage and change the concept of traditional family as enshrined in the Constitution (Spain);
- 106.45. Amend Article 37 of the 1998 Employment Equality Act in order to prevent such discrimination against homosexual and unmarried parents (Switzerland);
- 106.46. Enact legislation to make the right to collective bargaining through trade unions in the line with international commitments (Norway);
- 106.47. Encourage diversity and tolerance of other faiths and beliefs in the education system by monitoring incidents of discrimination on the basis of belief (Turkey);
- 106.48. Eliminate religious discrimination in access to education (Egypt);
- 106.49. Adopt necessary measures to legally recognize the human rights of all minorities and ethnic groups that are residing in the country (Ecuador);
107. The recommendations below did not enjoy the support of country Ireland:
- 107.1. Consider becoming a party (Turkey ); the possibility to (Argentina, Ecuador, Peru) sign and ratify the International Convention on Migrant Workers and Members of their Family (Algeria, Egypt ), incorporate it into law (Iran), and accede to its principles (Mexico);
- 107.2. Enact laws and design plans and strategies in the area of combatting racism, racial discrimination, and racial profiling and investigate relevant cases to ensure providing reparations to victims (Egypt );
- 107.3. Consider reviewing its law on the minimum age of criminal responsibility to be in conformity with international human rights standards (Timor-Leste );
- 107.4. Bring its abortion laws in line with ICCPR (Norway);
- 107.5. Introduce legislation to implement the European Court of Human Rights judgement in the A, B and C versus Ireland case (United Kingdom );
- 107.6. Take measures to revise the law on abortion with a view of permitting ~~termination of pregnancy in cases where pregnancy is a result of rape or incest, or in~~ situations where the pregnancy puts the physical or mental health or wellbeing of the pregnant woman or the pregnant girl in danger (Denmark );
- 107.7. Allow abortion at least when pregnancy poses a risk to the health of the pregnant woman (Slovenia );
- 107.8. Adopt legislative measure that guaranty greater integration of women as well as the safeguards of their personal rights and reproductive health care and reform the Offense Against Person Act of 1861 to decriminalise abortion under certain circumstances to make the legislative (Spain );

107.9. Ensure that the establishment of an expert group on abortion matters will lead to a coherent legal framework including the provision of adequate services (Netherlands);

107.10. Legislate against racial profiling and strengthen its efforts to promote the human treatment of migrants and people of non-Irish origin by law enforcement officers (Iran);

107.11. Consider adopting measures to prohibit any form of racial profiling from police and law enforcement officials (Brazil);

107.12. Adopt legislation that prohibits any form of racial profiling and furthermore strengthen its efforts to promote the human treatment of migrants and people of non-Irish origin by the Garda Síochána and other law enforcement personnel in accordance with international human rights law (Azerbaijan);

107.13. Strengthen its laws to prohibit racial profiling and strengthen its efforts to promote a humane, dignified and non-selective treatment for migrants and other persons who are not from Irish origin (Honduras);

107.14. Insure the protection of the rights of domestic migrant workers the majority of whom are women whose rights are not protected under the 2004 Law on parity (Uzbekistan);

107.15. Introduce a law allowing for family reunions as well as a law granting refugees the right to work (Czech Republic);

108. All conclusions and/or recommendations contained in the present report reflect the position of the submitting State(s) and/or the State under review. They should not be construed as endorsed by the Working Group as a whole.

## Annex

### Composition of the delegation

The delegation of Ireland was headed by; **H.E. Mr. Alan Shatter, T.D.**, Minister for Justice and Equality, and composed of the following members:

- **H.E. Ambassador Gerard Corr**, Permanent Mission of Ireland to the UN, Geneva
- **Mr. Diarmuid Cole**, Assistant Secretary, Department of Justice and Equality, Dublin, Ireland
- **Mr. Colin Wrafter**, Director of Human Rights Unit, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, Dublin, Ireland
- **Mr. Deaglán Ó Briain**, Principal Officer, Department of Justice and Equality, Dublin, Ireland
- **Ms. Garaldine Luddy**, Principal Officer, Department of Health, Dublin, Ireland
- **Mr. Thomas Cooney**, Adviser to the Minister for Justice and Equality, Dublin, Ireland
- **Mr. Mícheál Tierney**, Deputy Permanent Representative, Permanent Mission of Ireland to the UN, Geneva
- **Ms. Janet Lacey**, Assistant Principal Officer, Department of Justice and Equality, Dublin, Ireland
- **Ms. Joan Regan**, Assistant Principal Officer, Department of Health, Dublin, Ireland
- **Ms. Layla de Cogan Chin**, Administrative Officer, Department of Justice and Equality, Dublin, Ireland
- **Ms. Bernadette Phelan**, Administrative Officer, Department of Justice and Equality, Dublin, Ireland
- **Mr. Damien Ó Bráonain**, Private Secretary to the Minister for Justice and Equality, Dublin, Ireland
- **Ms. Joanne Kirk**, Higher Executive Officer, Department of Justice and Equality, Dublin, Ireland
- **Ms. Ciara Kellegher**, Press Officer, Department of Justice and Equality, Dublin, Ireland
- **Ms. Caroline Sweeney**, Human Rights Officer, Permanent Mission of Ireland to the UN, Geneva
- **Ms. Sarah Farrelly**, Human Rights Officer, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, Dublin, Ireland